

Message Text

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 STATE 067084
ORIGIN EA-12

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 CIAE-00 DODE-00 PM-05 H-01 INR-10
L-03 NSAE-00 NSC-05 PA-01 SP-02 SS-15 USIA-06
IO-13 /074 R

DRAFTED BY EA/K:PMCLEVELAND:JCM
APPROVED BY EA/K - MR. RICH
H - MR. KENNEY

-----002023 160546Z /20

P R 152344Z MAR 78
FM SECSTATE WASHDC
TO AMEMBASSY SEOUL PRIORITY
INFO AMEMBASSY TOKYO
CINCPAC

C O N F I D E N T I A L STATE 067084

CINCPAC FOR POLAD

E.O. 11652: GDS

TAGS: PEPR, KS

SUBJECT: ASSISTANT SECRETARY HOLBROOKE'S TESTIMONY ON
ROC/ROK TREATIES

REF: SEOUL 2036

1. HANGUK ILBO REPORT CITED REFTEL IS DISTORTION OF
OBJECTIVE COMPARISON OF ROC/ROK TREATIES MADE BY
ASSISTANT SECRETARY HOLBROOKE DURING MARCH 14 TESTIMONY
BEFORE THE HOUSE ASIAN AND PACIFIC AFFAIRS
SUBCOMMITTEE. IN RESPONSE TO QUESTION AT MARCH 9 WOLFF
SUBCOMMITTEE HEARING FROM CONGRESSMAN BEILENSON,
MR. HOLBROOKE BEGAN MARCH 14 TESTIMONY BEFORE COMMITTEE
BY BRIEFLY SUMMARIZING, AND THEN INTRODUCING FOR THE
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 STATE 067084

RECORD, AN INTERNAL RICH TO HOLBROOKE MEMORANDUM
COMPARING MAIN POINTS OF TWO TREATIES. MEMO,
COPIES OF WHICH PROVIDED BY HIRC STAFF TO REPORTERS
FOLLOWING HEARING, READS AS FOLLOWS:

BEGIN QUOTE

DURING YOUR LAST SESSION BEFORE THE WOLFF SUB-COMMITTEE CONGRESSMAN BEILENSON REQUESTED A COMPARISON OF THE ROK AND ROC MUTUAL DEFENSE TREATIES. THE TWO TREATIES ARE ATTACHED.

THEY ARE IN ESSENCE VERY SIMILAR. EXCEPT FOR MINOR DIFFERENCES BOTH CONTAIN THE SAME OPENING LIST OF PURPOSES. MOREOVER, THE KEY OPERATIVE ARTICLES OF BOTH ARE WRITTEN IN IDENTICAL OR SIMILAR LANGUAGE. BOTH TREATIES: A) UNDERTAKE TO SOLVE DISPUTES PEACEFULLY; B) DECLARE THAT IN THE EVENT OF AN ARMED ATTACK EACH OF THE PARTIES WILL ACT, "IN ACCORDANCE WITH ITS CONSTITUTIONAL PROCESSES," TO MEET THE COMMON DANGER; C) CONTAIN CONSULTATION CLAUSES; D) HAVE DECLARATIONS OF SELF HELP AND MUTUAL AID TO DEVELOP THEIR DEFENSE CAPABILITIES; E) GRANT THE U.S. BASE RIGHTS "AS DETERMINED BY MUTUAL AGREEMENT."

APART FROM SOME LANGUAGE VARIATIONS THE MAIN DIFFERENCES IN THE TREATIES ARE AS FOLLOWS: A) THE ROC TREATY ONLY HAS AN ARTICLE DECLARING THE PARTIES WILL STRENGTHEN THEIR "FREE INSTITUTIONS" AND COOPERATE ECONOMICALLY AND SOCIALLY; B) THE ROC TREATY APPLIES TO THE "WEST PACIFIC," THE ROK TREATY TO THE "PACIFIC," C) THE U.S. TAKES ON AN OBLIGATION IN THE ROC TREATY BUT NOT THE ROK TREATY TO MAINTAIN AND DEVELOP CAPACITY

CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 STATE 067084

TO RESIST COMMUNIST SUBVERSION; AND D) THE UN REFERENCES IN THE ROC TREATY ARE DIFFERENT BECAUSE THE ROC WAS A MEMBER AND THE ROK WAS NOT. END QUOTE

2. ON INSTRUCTIONS FROM MOFA ROK EMBASSY COUNSELOR PARK KEUN WOO RAISED QUESTION OF TREATY COMPARISON DURING MARCH 15 CALL AT EA/K AND WE OUTLINED FACTS TO HIM. HE READILY UNDERSTOOD DISTORTION INVOLVED, APOLOGIZED FOR COMPETITIVE, OVEREAGER ROK PRESS, AND SAID HE WOULD SET MOFA AND LOCAL HANGUK ILBO REPORTER STRAIGHT.

3. ACTION REQUESTED: REQUEST EMBASSY POINT OUT TO MOFA AND HANGUK ILBO OBJECTIVE NATURE OF COMPARISON WHICH WAS MADE AND WHICH WOULD BE READILY APPARENT TO ANYONE READING TWO TREATIES. MR. HOLBROOKE MADE NO ATTEMPT TO DRAW ANY VALUE JUDGMENTS, OR EXPAND ON MEANING OF TREATIES. YOU MAY ALSO MAKE POINT THAT THIS TYPE OF INACCURATE REPORTING IS NOT HELPFUL. VANCE

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 STATE 067084
ORIGIN EA-12

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 /013 R

66011

DRAFTED BY:EA/ROC/DOUGLAS PARADIS
APPROVED BY:EA/ROC/DOUGLAS PARADIS

-----057091 191330Z /47

R 190600Z MAR 78
FM SECSTATE WASHDC
INFO AMEMBASSY TAIPEI 0656

C O N F I D E N T I A L STATE 067084

FOLLOWING REPEAT STATE 067084 ACTION SEOUL INFO TOKYO CINCPAC
MAR 15

QUOTE F I D E N T I A L STATE 067084

CINCPAC FOR POLAD

E.O. 11652: GDS

TAGS: PEPR, KS

SUBJECT: ASSISTANT SECRETARY HOLBROOKE'S TESTIMONY ON
ROC/ROK TREATIES

REF: SEOUL 2036

1. HANGUK ILBO REPORT CITED REFTEL IS DISTORTION OF
OBJECTIVE COMPARISON OF ROC/ROK TREATIES MADE BY
ASSISTANT SECRETARY HOLBROOKE DURING MARCH 14 TESTIMONY
BEFORE THE HOUSE ASIAN AND PACIFIC AFFAIRS
SUBCOMMITTEE. IN RESPONSE TO QUESTION AT MARCH 9 WOLFF
SUBCOMMITTEE HEARING FROM CONGRESSMAN BEILENSON,
MR. HOLBROOKE BEGAN MARCH 14 TESTIMONY BEFORE COMMITTEE
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 STATE 067084

BY BRIEFLY SUMMARIZING, AND THEN INTRODUCING FOR THE
RECORD, AN INTERNAL RICH TO HOLBROOKE MEMORANDUM
COMPARING MAIN POINTS OF TWO TREATIES. MEMO,

COPIES OF WHICH PROVIDED BY HIRC STAFF TO REPORTERS
FOLLOWING HEARING, READS AS FOLLOWS:

BEGIN QUOTE

DURING YOUR LAST SESSION BEFORE THE WOLFF SUB-
COMMITTEE CONGRESSMAN BEILENSON REQUESTED A COMPARISON
OF THE ROK AND ROC MUTUAL DEFENSE TREATIES. THE TWO
TREATIES ARE ATTACHED.

THEY ARE IN ESSENCE VERY SIMILAR. EXCEPT FOR MINOR
DIFFERENCES BOTH CONTAIN THE SAME OPENING LIST OF
PURPOSES. MOREOVER, THE KEY OPERATIVE ARTICLES OF BOTH
ARE WRITTEN IN IDENTICAL OR SIMILAR LANGUAGE. BOTH
TREATIES: A) UNDERTAKE TO SOLVE DISPUTES PEACEFULLY;
B) DECLARE THAT IN THE EVENT OF AN ARMED ATTACK EACH OF
THE PARTIES WILL ACT, "IN ACCORDANCE WITH ITS
CONSTITUTIONAL PROCESSES," TO MEET THE COMMON DANGER;
C) CONTAIN CONSULTATION CLAUSES; D) HAVE DECLARATIONS
OF SELF HELP AND MUTUAL AID TO DEVELOP THEIR DEFENSE
CAPABILITIES; E) GRANT THE U.S. BASE RIGHTS "AS DETER-
MINED BY MUTUAL AGREEMENT."

APART FROM SOME LANGUAGE VARIATIONS THE MAIN
DIFFERENCES IN THE TREATIES ARE AS FOLLOWS: A) THE ROC
TREATY ONLY HAS AN ARTICLE DECLARING THE PARTIES WILL
STRENGTHEN THEIR "FREE INSTITUTIONS" AND COOPERATE
ECONOMICALLY AND SOCIALLY; B) THE ROC TREATY APPLIES TO
THE "WEST PACIFIC," THE ROK TREATY TO THE "PACIFIC,"
C) THE U.S. TAKES ON AN OBLIGATION IN THE ROC TREATY
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 STATE 067084

BUT NOT THE ROK TREATY TO MAINTAIN AND DEVELOP CAPACITY
TO RESIST COMMUNIST SUBVERSION; AND D) THE UN REFERENCES
IN THE ROC TREATY ARE DIFFERENT BECAUSE THE ROC WAS A
MEMBER AND THE ROK WAS NOT. END QUOTE

2. ON INSTRUCTIONS FROM MOFA ROK EMBASSY COUNSELOR PARK
KEUN WOO RAISED QUESTION OF TREATY COMPARISON DURING
MARCH 15 CALL AT EA/K AND WE OUTLINED FACTS TO HIM. HE
READILY UNDERSTOOD DISTORTION INVOLVED, APOLOGIZED FOR
COMPETITIVE, OVEREAGER ROK PRESS, AND SAID HE WOULD SET
MOFA AND LOCAL HANGUK ILBO REPORTER STRAIGHT.

3. ACTION REQUESTED: REQUEST EMBASSY POINT OUT TO MOFA
AND HANGUK ILBO OBJECTIVE NATURE OF COMPARISON WHICH
WAS MADE AND WHICH WOULD BE READILY APPARENT TO ANYONE
READING TWO TREATIES. MR. HOLBROOKE MADE NO ATTEMPT
TO DRAW ANY VALUE JUDGMENTS, OR EXPAND ON MEANING OF
TREATIES. YOU MAY ALSO MAKE POINT THAT THIS TYPE OF

INACCURATE REPORTING IS NOT HELPFUL. VANCE. UNQUOTE VANCE

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: X
Capture Date: 01 jan 1994
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: AGREEMENTS, US CONGRESSIONAL HEARINGS
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Draft Date: 15 mar 1978
Decaption Date: 01 jan 1960
Decaption Note:
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 20 Mar 2014
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1978STATE067084
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: PMCLEVELAND:JCM
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: GS
Errors: N/A
Expiration:
Film Number: D780116-0768
Format: TEL
From: STATE
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1978/newtext/t19780364/aaaacbuu.tel
Line Count: 225
Litigation Code IDs:
Litigation Codes:
Litigation History:
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Message ID: 063b4bc6-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Office: ORIGIN EA
Original Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Original Handling Restrictions: n/a
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 5
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a
Previous Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Reference: 78 SEOUL 2036
Retention: 0
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 13 may 2005
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review Media Identifier:
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
SAS ID: 3318697
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: ASSISTANT SECRETARY HOLBROOKE'S TESTIMONY ON ROC/ROK TREATIES
TAGS: PEPR, KS
To: SEOUL
Type: TE
vdkgvwkey: odb://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS_Docs/063b4bc6-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Review Markings:
Sheryl P. Walter
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
20 Mar 2014
Markings: Sheryl P. Walter Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 20 Mar 2014